Selection rules for the detection of gravitational waves in axion haloscopes

Next Hidden and Asymmetry Webminar May 23, 2023

Camilo García Cely

Ramón y Cajal Researcher







Based on

Novel Search for High-Frequency Gravitational Waves with Low-Mass Axion Haloscopes

Valerie Domcke, Camilo Garcia-Cely, and Nicholas L. Rodd Phys. Rev. Lett. **129**, 041101 – Published 20 July 2022

Optimizing the geometry of axion haloscopes for gravitational wave searches

Valerie Domcke,¹ Camilo Garcia-Cely,² Sung Mook Lee,³ Nicholas L. Rodd¹

³Department of Physics & IPAP & Lab for Dark Universe, Yonsei University, Seoul 03722, Korea

work in progress: 2306.xxxxx

¹ Theoretical Physics Department, CERN, 1 Esplanade des Particules, CH-1211 Geneva 23, Switzerland

²Instituto de Física Corpuscular (IFIC), Universitat de València-CSIC, Parc Científic UV, C/ Catedrático José Beltrán 2, E-46980 Paterna, Spain

Outline

• Why high-frequency gravitational waves and ideas to detect them

• Gravitational-wave vs. Axion electrodynamics



• Conclusions

Why high-frequency gravitational waves and ideas to detect them

- Speculation by Poincaré (1905)
- Einstein provided a firm theoretical background for them (1916)

 $\Box h_{\mu\nu} = -16\pi G T_{\mu\nu} \quad \text{describing two}$

wave equation describing two polarization modes



- Speculation by Poincaré (1905)
- Einstein provided a firm theoretical background for them (1916)



 $\Box h_{\mu\nu} = -16\pi G T_{\mu\nu}$ describing two

wave equation describing two polarization modes



The deformation of a ring of test masses due to the different polarization

- Speculation by Poincaré (1905)
- Einstein provided a firm theoretical background for them (1916)



8

6

4

2

0







No known astrophysical objects are small and dense enough to produce gravitational waves beyond 10 kHz

High-frequency gravitational waves



 $\log_{10}(f/\text{Hz})$

Revisiting Gertsenhstein's ideas

SOVIET PHYSICS JETP

VOLUME 16, NUMBER 2

FEBRUARY, 1963

ON THE DETECTION OF LOW FREQUENCY GRAVITATIONAL WAVES

M. E. GERTSENSHTEIN and V. I. PUSTOVOIT

Submitted to JETP editor March 3, 1962

J. Exptl. Theoret: Phys: (U.S.S.R.) 43, 605-607 (August, 1962)

It is shown that the sensitivity of the electromechanical experiments for detecting gravitational waves by means of piezocrystals is ten orders of magnitude worse than that estimated by Weber.^[1] In the low frequency range it should be possible to detect gravitational waves by the shift of the bands in an optical interferometer. The sensitivity of this method is investigated. Terrestrial interferometers



11

Revisiting Gertsenhstein's ideas

SOVIET PHYSICS JETP

VOLUME 14, NUMBER 1

WAVE RESONANCE OF LIGHT AND GRAVITIONAL WAVES

M. E. GERTSENSHTEĬN

Submitted to JETP editor July 29, 1960

J. Exptl. Theoret. Phys. (U.S.S.R.) 41, 113-114 (July, 1961)

The energy of gravitational waves excited during the propagation of light in a constant magnetic or electric field is estimated.

SOVIET PHYSICS JETP

VOLUME 16, NUMBER 2

FEBRUARY, 1963

JANUARY, 1962

ON THE DETECTION OF LOW FREQUENCY GRAVITATIONAL WAVES

M. E. GERTSENSHTEIN and V. I. PUSTOVOIT

Submitted to JETP editor March 3, 1962

J. Exptl. Theoret: Phys: (U.S.S.R.) 43, 605-607 (August, 1962)

It is shown that the sensitivity of the electromechanical experiments for detecting gravitational waves by means of piezocrystals is ten orders of magnitude worse than that estimated by Weber.^[1] In the low frequency range it should be possible to detect gravitational waves by the shift of the bands in an optical interferometer. The sensitivity of this method is investigated. Terrestrial interferometers



• The conversion of gravitational waves into electromagnetic waves is a classical process. Its rate does not involve \hbar

 $P \sim GB^2 L^2$

• The conversion of gravitational waves into electromagnetic waves is a classical process. Its rate does not involve \hbar

 $P \sim GB^2 L^2$

• Involving gravity the conversion probabilities are small. It may be compensated by a 'detector' of cosmological size.

Potential of Radio Telescopes as High-Frequency Gravitational Wave Detectors

Valerie Domcke and Camilo Garcia-Cely Phys. Rev. Lett. **126**, 021104 – Published 14 January 2021



• The conversion of gravitational waves into electromagnetic waves is a classical process. Its rate does not involve \hbar

 $P \sim GB^2 L^2$

• Involving gravity the conversion probabilities are small. It may be compensated by a 'detector' of cosmological size.

Potential of Radio Telescopes as High-Frequency Gravitational Wave Detectors

Valerie Domcke and Camilo Garcia-Cely Phys. Rev. Lett. **126**, 021104 – Published 14 January 2021



• The process is strictly analogous to axion dark matter conversion.

Raffelt, Stodolski'89

The QCD axion as dark matter

• Pseudoscalar field



• Solution to the strong CP problem

Peccei, Quinn 1977

• Excellent dark matter candidate

Weinberg, Wilczek 1978



Axion electrodynamics

Axions act as a source term to Maxwell's equations, effectively inducing an electromagnetic current.

$$\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} = 0 \qquad \text{sikivie, 1983}$$

$$\nabla \times \mathbf{E} + \partial_t \mathbf{B} = 0$$

$$\nabla \cdot \mathbf{E} = j^0$$

$$\nabla \times \mathbf{B} - \partial_t \mathbf{E} = \mathbf{j}$$

$$j^0 = -g_{a\gamma\gamma} \nabla a \cdot \mathbf{B} \qquad \mathbf{j} = g_{a\gamma\gamma} \left(\nabla a \times \mathbf{E} + \partial_t a \mathbf{B} \right)$$

Axion electrodynamics

• Helioscopes (X rays)



 \mathcal{A}



• Haloscopes (radio frequencies)



 B^{γ}



• Purely lab experiments



- microwave cavities
- MADMAX
- ADMX
- HAYSTAC
- ABRACADABRA
- Lumped element detectors
- ...
- Light shining through the walls
- OSCAR
- ALPS II

• ...

Camilo García Cely, University of Valencia



Gravitational wave versus axion electrodynamics

Novel Search for High-Frequency Gravitational Waves with Low-Mass Axion Haloscopes

Valerie Domcke, Camilo Garcia-Cely, and Nicholas L. Rodd Phys. Rev. Lett. **129**, 041101 – Published 20 July 2022

Low mass axion haloscopes



 \dot{j}_{eff}

The electromagnetic fields produced by the axion drive a current through a pickup coil

Low mass axion haloscopes



 $\nabla \times \mathbf{B} - \partial_t \mathbf{E} = g_{a\gamma\gamma} \,\partial_t a \,\mathbf{B}_{\mathbf{0}}$





physics

Search for axion-like dark matter with ferromagnets

Alexander V. Gramolin [©]¹, Deniz Aybas [©]^{1,2}, Dorian Johnson¹, Janos Adam¹ and Alexander O. Sushkov [©]^{1,2,3} [⊠]



PRL 117, 141801 (2016) PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 30 SEPTEMB	17, 141801 (2016)	PHYSICAL	REVIEW	LETTERS	30 SEPTEMB
---	--------------------------	----------	--------	---------	------------

Broadband and Resonant Approaches to Axion Dark Matter Detection

Yonatan Kahn,^{1,*} Benjamin R. Safdi,^{2,†} and Jesse Thaler^{2,‡} ¹Department of Physics, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey 08544, USA ²Center for Theoretical Physics, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02139, USA (Received 3 March 2016; published 30 September 2016)

The electromagnetic fields produced by the axion drive a current through a pickup coil

Gravitational wave electrodynamics

GWs act as a source term to Maxwell's equations, effectively inducing an electromagnetic current.

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \eta_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu} \qquad \left| h_{\mu\nu} \right| \ll 1$$



$$j^{\mu}_{\text{eff}} = \partial_{\nu} \left(-\frac{1}{2} h F^{\mu\nu} + F^{\mu\alpha} h^{\nu}_{\ \alpha} - F^{\nu\alpha} h^{\mu}_{\ \alpha} \right)$$

More explicit comparison to axions

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \eta_{\mu\nu} + h_{\mu\nu} \qquad \left| h_{\mu\nu} \right| \ll 1$$



$$\nabla \cdot \mathbf{E} = -\nabla \cdot \mathbf{P}$$

$$\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} = 0$$

$$\nabla \times \mathbf{E} = -\partial_t \mathbf{B}$$

$$\nabla \times \mathbf{B} = \partial_t \mathbf{E} + \nabla \times \mathbf{M} + \partial_t \mathbf{P}$$

$$P_i = -h_{ij}E_j$$
 $M_i = -h_{ij}B_j$ (in the TT gauge)
Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695

More explicit comparison to axions

Axions act as a source term to Maxwell's equations, effectively inducing an electromagnetic current.

$$\nabla \cdot \mathbf{E} = -\nabla \cdot \mathbf{P}$$

$$\nabla \cdot \mathbf{B} = 0$$

$$\nabla \times \mathbf{E} = -\partial_t \mathbf{B}$$

$$\nabla \times \mathbf{B} = \partial_t \mathbf{E} + \nabla \times \mathbf{M} + \partial_t \mathbf{P}$$

$$\mathbf{P} = g_{a\gamma\gamma} a \mathbf{B}, \quad \mathbf{M} = g_{a\gamma\gamma} a \mathbf{E}$$

McAllister et al, 1803.07755 Tobar et al, 1809.01654 Ouellet et al, 1809.10709

	Axion electrodynamics	Gravitational wave electrodynamics			
An example	$a \uparrow \gamma$ $\sim N$ B	Gertsenshtein effect			
Effective current	$\mathbf{P} = g_{a\gamma\gamma} a \mathbf{B}, \mathbf{M} = g_{a\gamma\gamma} a \mathbf{E}$	$P_i = -h_{ij}E_j \qquad M_i = -h_{ij}B_j$			
$j_{\rm eff}^{\mu} = \left(-\nabla \cdot \mathbf{P}, \nabla \times \mathbf{M} + \partial_t \mathbf{P} \right)$	McAllister et al, 1803.07755 Tobar et al, 1809.01654 Ouellet et al, 1809.10709	(in the TT gauge) Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695			
Benchmark	QCD axion	$h \sim 10^{-22}$			

DMRadio program



DMRadio program

Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695



Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695





Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695



• Only one polarization

Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695





- Only one polarization
- Suppression at small frequencies

 $[\]omega R \ll 1$

Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695



- Only one polarization
- Suppression at small frequencies

• The sensitivity scaling with the volume is faster than for axions

 $[\]omega R \ll 1$

Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695



- Only one polarization
- Suppression at small frequencies

• The sensitivity scaling with the volume is faster than for axions

 $[\]omega R \ll 1$

Optimizing the geometry of axion haloscopes for gravitational wave searches

Valerie Domcke,¹ Camilo Garcia-Cely,² Sung Mook Lee,³ Nicholas L. Rodd¹

work in progress: 2306.xxxxx

DMRadio program



Beyond toroidal configurations

Domcke, CGC, Lee, Rodd (in progress)

ADMX SLIC: Results from a Superconducting *LC* Circuit Investigating Cold Axions

N. Crisosto, P. Sikivie, N. S. Sullivan, D. B. Tanner, J. Yang, and G. Rybka Phys. Rev. Lett. **124**, 241101 – Published 17 June 2020



Solenoidal external field and vertical pickup loop

Domcke, CGC, Lee, Rodd (in progress)

Write down the detector response matrix for a wave coming from an arbitrary direction, and impose **cylindrical symmetry** for both external magnetic field and loop:

Domcke, CGC, Lee, Rodd (in progress)

Write down the detector response matrix for a wave coming from an arbitrary direction, and impose **cylindrical symmetry** for both external magnetic field and loop:

1. At $(\omega L)^2$ order, only h^+ contribution survives.

Domcke, CGC, Lee, Rodd (in progress)

Write down the detector response matrix for a wave coming from an arbitrary direction, and impose **cylindrical symmetry** for both external magnetic field and loop:

- 1. At $(\omega L)^2$ order, only h^+ contribution survives.
- 2. To all orders in (ωL) , there is either only a h^+ or h^{\times} term depending on the direction of the external field **B** and the normal vector of the pick-up loop $\hat{\mathbf{n}}'$.

Domcke, CGC, Lee, Rodd (in progress)

Expect

 $\omega L \ll 1$

Write down the detector response matrix for a wave coming from an arbitrary direction, and impose **cylindrical symmetry** for both external magnetic field and loop:

- 1. At $(\omega L)^2$ order, only h^+ contribution survives.
- 2. To all orders in (ωL) , there is either only a h^+ or h^{\times} term depending on the direction of the external field **B** and the normal vector of the pick-up loop $\hat{\mathbf{n}}'$.

		B			
		$\hat{\mathbf{e}}_z$ (Solenoid)	$\hat{\mathbf{e}}_{\phi}$ (Toroid)		
	$\hat{\mathbf{e}}_z$	h_+ and $\mathcal{O}[(\omega L)^2]$	h_{\times} and $\mathcal{O}[(\omega L)^3]$		
$\hat{\mathbf{n}}'$	$\hat{\mathbf{e}}_{\phi}$	h_{\times} and $\mathcal{O}[(\omega L)^3]$	h_+ and $\mathcal{O}[(\omega L)^2]$		
	$\hat{\mathbf{e}}_{ ho}$	h_+ and $\mathcal{O}[(\omega L)^3]$	h_{\times} and $\mathcal{O}[(\omega L)^4]$		

There are more rules: I warmly invite you to have a look at the paper in a few days

Gravitational waves in low mass axion haloscopes

Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695



Domcke, CGC, Lee, Rodd (in progress)

Proper detector frame

In the proper detector frame the coordinate system closely matches the intuitive description of an Earth-based laboratory, with the gravitational wave acting as a Newtonian force.

Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695

The ω^2 dependence is unavoidable

Proper detector frame

In the proper detector frame the coordinate system closely matches the intuitive description of an Earth-based laboratory, with the gravitational wave acting as a Newtonian force.

Domcke, CGC, Rodd, 2202.00695

The ω^2 dependence is unavoidable



Detecting High-Frequency Gravitational Waves with Microwave Cavities

Asher Berlin (New York U. and Fermilab), Diego Blas (Barcelona, Autonoma U. and Barcelona, IFAE), Raffaele Tito D'Agnolo (IPhT, Saclay), Sebastian A.R. Ellis (U. Geneva (main) and IPhT, Saclay), Roni Harnik (Fermilab) et al. (Dec 21, 2021)

e-Print: 2112.11465 [hep-ph]

The techniques developed for detecting axion dark matter could potentially be used to discover new sources of gravitational waves.

The techniques developed for detecting axion dark matter could potentially be used to discover new sources of gravitational waves.

Selection rules in detectors exhibiting cylindrical symmetry enforce cancellations in the flux associated to gravitational waves.

The techniques developed for detecting axion dark matter could potentially be used to discover new sources of gravitational waves.

Selection rules in detectors exhibiting cylindrical symmetry enforce cancellations in the flux associated to gravitational waves.

These cancellations can be avoided by changing the geometry of the pickup loop. We demonstrate this for different detector geometries, obtaining a parametric increase of sensitivity.

The techniques developed for detecting axion dark matter could potentially be used to discover new sources of gravitational waves.

Selection rules in detectors exhibiting cylindrical symmetry enforce cancellations in the flux associated to gravitational waves.

These cancellations can be avoided by changing the geometry of the pickup loop. We demonstrate this for different detector geometries, obtaining a parametric increase of sensitivity.

Different experimental proposals have coalesced on a strain sensitivity of 10^{-22} for MHz GWs, still orders of magnitude away from signals of the early Universe. Whether we can hope to probe such strain sensitivities remains to be determined.

Other possibilities



Camilo García Cely, University of Valencia

Oscillations after the formation of the CMB

$$\left(\Box + \omega_{\rm pl}^2\right) A_{\lambda} = -B\partial_{\ell}h_{\lambda}$$
$$\Box h_{\lambda} = 16\pi GB \,\partial_{\ell}A_{\lambda}$$

 $\left< \Gamma_{g \leftrightarrow \gamma} \right> = \frac{2\pi G B^2 \ell_{\rm OSC}^2}{\Delta \ell}$

$$\omega_{\rm pl} = \sqrt{e^2 n_e / m_e}$$

The plasma frequency acts as an effective mass term
$$\ell_{\rm OSC} \simeq 4\omega / \omega_{\rm pl}^2$$

Although cosmic magnetic fields are not expected to be perfectly homogeneous, coherent oscillations take place in highly homogeneous patches.

$$\ell_{\rm OSC} = 4\omega/(1+z)^2 X_e(z) \omega_{\rm pl,0}^2 \ll 1 \, {\rm pc}$$

$$\mathscr{P} \equiv \int_{l.o.s.} \langle \Gamma_{g \leftrightarrow \gamma} \rangle dt = \int_{0}^{z_{\text{ini}}} \frac{\langle \Gamma_{g \leftrightarrow \gamma} \rangle}{(1+z)H} dz$$

Domcke, CGC 2021

Cosmic magnetic fields



PHYSICAL REVIEW LETTERS 123, 021301 (2019)

Stringent Limit on Primordial Magnetic Fields from the Cosmic Microwave Background Radiation

Karsten Jedamzik^{1,*} and Andrey Saveliev^{2,3,†} ¹Laboratoire Univers et Particules de Montpellier, UMR5299-CNRS, Université de Montpellier, 34095 Montpellier, France ²Institute of Physics, Mathematics and Information Technology, Immanuel Kant Baltic Federal University, 236016 Kaliningrad, Russia ³Faculty of Computational Mathematics and Cybernetics, Lomonosov Moscow State University, 119991 Moscow, Russia

(Received 8 May 2018; revised manuscript received 13 September 2018; published 10 July 2019)

Scie	nce	Contents 👻	News -	Careers -	Journals	•	
SHARE	REPORT						
f	Evider	nce for Str	ong Exti	ragalactic	Magne	etic Fields	from
9	Fermi	Observati	ons of T	eV Blazar	S		
in	Andrii Nerono + See all autho	v*, levgen Vovk rs and affiliations					
6	Science 02 Ap Vol. 328, Issue DOI: 10.1126/s	r 2010: 5974, pp. 73-75 science.1184192					
	Article	Figures &	& Data	Info & Metrie	S	eLetters	🔁 PDF

Domcke, CGC 2021

Upper bounds on stochastic gravitational waves

